

Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES 1st FLOOR, CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS CITY HALL BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL OCTOBER 20, 2014 4:00 P.M.

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2 Larry Romero

District 3 Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the City Council Chambers, 1st Floor, City Hall Building, October 20, 2014, 4:00 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

Chairman David Berchelmann Vice-Chairman Edgar Lopez Commissioner Beatriz Lucero Commissioner Randy Brock

Commissioner Cesar Gomez (left meeting at 5:15 p.m.)

Commissioner William Helm II Commissioner John Moses Commissioner Ricardo Fernandez

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Economic Development

Ms. Kristen Hamilton, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's Office

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Berchelmann called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m., quorum present.

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

None.

CONGRATULATIONS

Ms. Velázquez congratulated Vice-Chairman Lopez and Commissioner Helm, again, this year; they have won three AIA awards this year. Two awards were for the Mulligan Building; the AIA and the Mayor's award.

Chairman Berchelmann, commissioners and staff congratulated Vice-Chairman Lopez and Commissioner Helm on their continued success.

I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

Economic & International Development
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov

Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community



Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

II. REGULAR AGENDA - DISCUSSION AND ACTION

Certificate of Appropriateness

1. PHAP14-00027: Being Mills Addition Portion of Block 17, City of El Paso, El Paso

County, Texas

Location: Arts Festival Plaza

Historic District: Downtown
Property Owner: City of El Paso
Representative: Gilbert Guerrero

Representative District: 8

Existing Zoning: C-5/H (Commercial/Historic)

Year Built: N/A Historic Status: N/A

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the existing

plaza and steps and the construction of a new pedestrian pathway with paving, trees, irrigation, street furniture and

alterations to the fountain after the fact

Application Filed: 10/6/14 45 Day Expiration: 11/20/14

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the existing plaza and steps and the construction of a new pedestrian pathway with paving, trees, irrigation, street furniture, lighting and alterations to the fountain after the fact.

In the Downtown Historic District is the Arts Festival Plaza, between the Museum of Art and the Plaza Theatre, where the Alfresco Friday concerts/performances are held. In 2011, former City Council Representative Susie Byrd requested the Historic Preservation Officer present public projects and public works located within historic districts, before the Commission.

Demolition has already begun. The project is basically a pedestrian pathway to connect parts of downtown together. Installation of new and maintaining some existing trees is proposed; furthermore, installation of new lighting and paving is also proposed. The existing fountain will be refurbished, as well.

Ms. Velázquez explained she recommended postponing the agenda item as commissioners and staff have received only a glimpse of the project. She had asked the applicant for renderings but that was not part of the scope for the architects. At this point, this was all she had to offer commissioners. She was not prepared to recommend approval or denial because she was not privy to the end of project information, too many unanswered questions.

Chairman Berchelmann asked what information was lacking.



Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Ms. Velázquez responded, for example:

- 1. The lighting fixtures:
 - a. how many will be installed in the tree wells;
 - b. it was her understanding there would be streams of lights in the Plaza; however, she did not know which streams that would be.
- 2. The park benches:
 - a. how many;
 - b. what will the benches look like;
 - c. what are the materials;
 - d. it was her understanding the park benches would be Corten steel which is not a material we see in the Downtown Historic District.
- 3. The trees:
 - a. what kind to be installed;
- 4. The fountain:
 - a. how will the fountain be redone;
 - b. new materials.

Chairman Berchelmann wondered if the demolition was complete.

Ms. Velázquez clarified the demolition has begun; however, construction has not.

Mr. Gilbert Guerrero, Project Manager, Engineering & Construction Management, gave a presentation. This project is part of an overall 'Pedestrian Pathway' project from Sheldon Court to the entertainment district on San Francisco Street.

- a. Series of two steps in the Plaza, not conducive to public events:
 - i. The steps will become a flattened area;
 - ii. Colored concrete;
 - iii. Allow large crowds to sit down, watch performances;
 - iv. Allow easier accessibility, especially ADA compliance
 - 1. Proposed ADA ramp will be along the Museum of Art;
 - 2. Ramp will allow flow of easier pedestrian traffic.
- b. 16 trees to be installed:
 - i. Southern Live Oaks, Texas Ash, Texas Red Oak;
 - ii. Some trees installed in planters with tree grates.
- c. Planters:
 - i. Corten steel with seating around;
 - ii. Benches attached to corten steel around the planters.
- d. Tree grates:
 - i. Some tree grates will have lights;
 - ii. Pre-cast concrete seating;

Economic & International Development
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov

Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community



City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

- e. Water feature (fountain) to be refurbished:
 - i. Corten steel on the columns and top;
 - ii. Cast in place concrete base on the bottom, bottom can be used as seating;
 - iii. Fountain wall (water fall) will be stone veneer.
- f. Lighting:
 - i. Tree upright inside the planter area;
 - ii. Grade level within the tree grates;
 - iii. Above the Plaza.

Mr. Guerrero explained the contract does not provide for a rendering; hopefully, the presentation will provide a glimpse of the end result. The project basically is to provide accessibility during the outdoor events.

Vice-Chairman Lopez wondered why the plans were not submitted before the demolition began.

Mr. Guerrero deferred the Vice-Chairman's question to the architects; however, when he received the project, the drawings did not show the location within a historic district. Therefore, the Department proceeded with the bidding process. He apologized because he did not have an explanation why the location was not flagged properly.

Commissioner Helm asked what was going on with the south end of the site surrounding the existing water feature.

Mr. Guerrero responded the water feature is not part of this contract due to funding issues. Currently, the Museum of Art is investigating refurbishing the water feature as a planter; the water feature has not been utilized for some time. However, the concrete pavers adjacent to the planter will be replaced.

Chairman Berchelmann asked Mr. Guerrero why use Corten steel as an element for construction.

Mr. Guerrero responded for continuity. Corten steel will be installed in the other phases of this 'Pedestrian Pathway' project and the material was proposed by the architects selected for this project.

Commissioner Helm asked if the same architects were involved in the San Jacinto Plaza project. Additionally, is the materials palette consistent with that design as well?

Mr. Guerrero replied yes, "SWA."



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor Oscar Leeser Mr. Trent Okumura, Associate, SWA Group, replied yes, the Corten is used throughout to unify the link between all phases of the project, one of the reasons we continued and applied it to the Plaza.

City Council

Commissioner Helm added the colored concrete and the pavers?

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

Mr. Okumura responded the colors are the same used in all other phases of this project.

District 2
Larry Romero

Commissioner Gomez asked Ms. Velázquez if commissioners would be reviewing these other project phases.

District 3
Emma Acosta

shown the proposed plans for the San Jacinto Plaza and the Pedestrian Pathway between the Plaza Hotel and the Mills Building.

Commissioner Helm asked if commissioners had taken action, approved or denied those

Ms. Velázquez stated if they are within the historic district, yes. She noted commissioners were

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

projects.

Ms. Velázquez replied yes.

the design going through several phases.

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

Commissioner Gomez asked if commissioners had approved Corten steel on the other phases.

Ms. Velázquez responded three years ago, if I remember correctly, we probably approved

District 7 Lily Limón Chairman Berchelmann recalled commissioners were presented the plans for the San Jacinto Plaza; however, commissioners did not take any action.

Corten at the proposed Pedestrian Pathway in front of the Mills Building. She could not recall if

Corten was a proposed construction material for the San Jacinto Plaza; however, she did recall

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

Ms. Velázquez replied yes, you are correct; those plans were approved by the City Council.

Chairman Berchelmann explained that for continuity the same construction materials will be used.

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez Commissioner Helm was opposed to using Corten steel because that material has not been used in historic districts before. He understood the continuity of the construction materials but he was curious why the need for commissioners' input.

Vice-Chairman Lopez explained Corten steel is a low-maintenance construction material. He agreed using Corten to convey project continuity was necessary.

Chairman Berchelmann asked about the festoon lighting above the Plaza, would that be eight strands on top with six inch diameter cups.

Economic & International Development
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov
Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community



City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Mr. Okumura responded yes, approximately eight strands to be strung across the length of the Plaza, roughly 12 to 15 feet apart, from strand to strand.

Chairman Berchelmann asked Ms. Velázquez if there were other missing elements.

Ms. Velázquez replied we covered trees, benches, the lighting – *will there be any free standing light fixtures*?; we covered the tree wells, the fountain, and the paving.

Mr. Guerrero noted no speakers are proposed for this project; the performers supply their own amplification systems.

Chairman Berchelmann asked if the festoon lighting and cups would be silver in color.

Mr. Okumura explained the lighting as shown in this presentation is silver but they will be the same.

Chairman Berchelmann asked if all trees would be in planters.

Mr. Okumura responded there will be raised planters.

Commissioner Helm commented on the linear elements of the planters along each side of the north/south.

Mr. Okumura referred to the rectangular shaped elements, per the presentation, would be the raised planters which the benches will be attached to.

Chairman Berchelmann asked to see the proposed color (stone) for the water fountain

Mr. Okumura replied he did not have an image today; however, the stone will be a dark gray with tones due to irregularities/variation of the stone.

Chairman Berchelmann asked if there would be light fixtures on each column at the top. He wondered if there would be lights in place of that.

Mr. Okumura explained per the presentation those were the existing lights; there will be lights in the fountain basin up lighting the rear; however, there will not be a light in place of the existing.

Commissioner Moses confirmed the project would replace multiple terrace levels with a single level. He asked which end of the stairs, the north or the south.

Mr. Guerrero concurred; the stairs will be on the south end. Currently, there are three strands of two stairs; however, the project proposes six stairs in the front tapering off as you move northward into the Plaza.



Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Commissioner Moses questioned if the stairs would be the full width of the Plaza.

Mr. Guerrero explained approximately ¾ of the Plaza would have stairs; the other ¼ will be the ADA accessibility ramp.

Commissioner Moses wondered if the ramp railing would be stainless.

Mr. Okumura stated the ramp railing will be black, powder coated black.

Chairman Berchelmann asked Ms. Velázquez if all her questions had been answered.

Ms. Velázquez asked Chairman Berchelmann if commissioners felt they had a good grasp of the project.

Chairman Berchelmann stated, personally, he felt commissioners were comfortable enough to vote. The other commissioners agreed.

Commissioner Lucero asked Ms. Velázquez if she was comfortable with the information presented. She wanted to ensure all of Ms. Velázquez's questions were answered.

Ms. Velázquez responded yes, the presentation provided a clearer picture, she thought it was fine; however, the decision would be yours.

MOTION:

Motion made by Vice-Chairman Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Fernandez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY AT THE ARTS FESTIVAL PLAZA.

2. PHAP14-00028: Being 99 Government Hill, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas

Location: 4509 Trowbridge Drive

Historic District: Austin Terrace
Property Owner: Maria Rodriguez
Representative: Roy Gallego

Representative District: 2

Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)

Year Built: 1940

Historic Status: Contributing

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition

Application Filed: 10/6//14 45 Day Expiration: 11/20/14



City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition. The proposed addition is rather simple. It will be made of masonry and will match the rest of the property. The main façade, behind the wall, will look like masonry. The rear yard is quite large; however, the applicant is proposing to construct the addition in the side yard. The proposed addition, a bathroom, will meet the required setbacks and will not be visible from the rear.

Ms. Velázquez read the following into the record:

The Historic Preservation Office recommends *APPROVAL WITH A MODIFICATION** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- New additions should be designed and constructed so that the character-defining features of the historic building are not radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed in the process of rehabilitation.
- Any new addition should be planned so that it is constructed to the <u>rear of the property or on a non-character defining elevation and is minimally visible from the public right of way</u>.
- Introduce additions in locations that are <u>not visible from the street-generally on rear elevations.</u>
- Design an addition so it is compatible in roof form, proportions, materials and details with the existing structure.
- Design an addition so that if removed in the future, the historic building's form and character defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

• New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

*THE MODIFICATION IS THAT THE ADDITION BE RELOCATED TO THE REAR FAÇADE TO BE IN CONFORMANCE WITH THE DESIGN GUIDELINES.

Chairman Berchelmann asked Ms. Velázquez if she had informed the property owner of her modification.

Ms. Velázquez responded she had not conveyed that information to the property owner.

Mr. Roy Gallego, contractor, explained this was his aunt's home, he would be helping her.



City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Ms. Velázquez explained to Mr. Gallego rather than constructing the addition on side, she recommended the addition be located in the back. There is an existing door and window. The Historic District Guidelines recommend additions be located in the rear, not on the side, so as not to be visible from the right-of-way and does not alter the appearance.

Mr. Gallego replied no, he could not construct the addition where the back door is because of the location of the septic tank. With the proposed location, on the side with the rock wall, the addition will not be visible at all.

Commissioner Helm clarified Mr. Gallego would be extending the existing roofline, a sort of extrusion, which would be problematic if the addition was located in the rear.

Mr. Gallego concurred with Commissioner Helm and added there would not be any room there; the roof is already coming down on the back side.

Commissioner Helm asked to see the elevation and floor plans again. He asked if Mr. Gallego would be wrapping the rock wall all the way around.

Mr. Gallego responded yes, and take it up all the way.

Commissioner Helm asked Mr. Gallego if the portion that faces the front of the property above the fence would be rock wall as well.

Mr. Gallego responded yes, that was going all the way up.

Chairman Berchelmann reiterated there was a septic tank in the rear.

Mr. Gallego replied yes, the way the house is designed, the back is, he can touch the roof in the back. So, if he started there, by the time he added on, there would not be anything there.

Commissioner Helm stated it would be code. He then asked to see the photograph of the front of the property again.

Mr. Gallego explained the addition would be located just on the other side of the rock wall; furthermore, the rock wall will go all the way and the tree would cover most of it.

Chairman Berchelmann asked how high the existing rock wall is.

Mr. Gallego replied seven feet high.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked if Mr. Gallego would be providing the five-foot setback.

Mr. Gallego responded yes, on the side, he has that easy.



Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Commissioner Gomez asked if Mr. Gallego would be using part of the rock wall as part of the structure in the front.

Mr. Gallego explained he will be taking it down then building it back up.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked if Mr. Gallego would be using the same raw material, as the existing structure, for the addition including the color of the eaves and profile, etc.

Mr. Gallego responded everything would be the same as the house.

Commissioner Helm asked if there was a photo of the rear of the property.

Ms. Velázquez responded no.

Commissioner Helm asked to see the elevation plans again. He asked Mr. Gallego if there was a concrete band on the lintel.

Mr. Gallego explained it was a band with foam and cemented to look like that but not a concrete band, not structural.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked if Mr. Gallego would be continuing with that back. Mr. Gallego responded yes, it will look like that around the back right here, same thing where this room was, the rock wall went all the way up to the roof line.

Commissioner Helm asked Mr. Gallego if that was an operable window.

Mr. Gallego replied no.

Vice-Chairman Lopez explained he saw Ms. Velázquez's concern but after reviewing the floor plan, moving the restroom to rear will block all the windows, doors and access. Also, there would be issues with the roof line. Mr. Gallego stated he would provide the five foot setback, as required. Vice-Chairman Lopez explained rock wall would have to raised to eight feet to 'hide' the addition from view, the materials and colors and the style of the eaves will match the existing house.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Helm, seconded by Commissioner Moses AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE AS SUBMITTED.



Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

3. PHAP14-00029: Being 46 Ysleta Tract 5 .1702 Acre, City of El Paso, El Paso County,

Texas

Location: 220 Candelaria Street

Historic District: Ysleta

Property Owner: Ricardo Chavez
Representative: Ricardo Chavez

Representative District: 6

Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)

Year Built: 1968

Historic Status: Non-Contributing

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal and replacement of

windows, doors, and window surrounds after the fact

Application Filed: 10/6/14 45 Day Expiration: 11/20/14

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal and replacement of windows, doors, and window surrounds after the fact. This property was cited by Code Compliance. Photos of the property taken during the last survey, 14 years ago, shows the wood framed windows and doors were in place. The property has been significantly altered with the removal of the door, the alteration of the opening and the installation of some sliding windows as well. The property owner has also installed some mesh window surrounds that Ms. Velázquez believes the property owner will cover with some stucco. Ms. Velázquez looked at other surrounding properties to investigate whether there were comparable features on those properties.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends *DENIAL* of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Ysleta Design Guidelines recommend the following:

- Windows are important character defining features because of significant detailing as in decorative windows, or because they help to define a pattern through the use of voids.
- Windows should be repaired rather than replaced. In most cases this will simply entail removing old paint, installing new weather stripping, and then repainting. If windows are damaged beyond repair, replacement windows should match the type, style, material and finish of the original. Do not plug, cover, and/or widen windows if they are on the exterior walls of the original structure.
- Window frames and trim are sometimes elaborate. In Ysleta, however, window treatment is usually basic and less ornate. Frames, lintels, and sills should preferably be constructed of wood. Metal alternatives may be used if finished. The finished must be in character with the overall appearance of the structure and adequately complement its style.
- Aluminum sliding windows are not in character with the Ysleta Historic District. Muntins should be installed on existing horizontal windows, so as to create the appearance of true divided light.

Economic & International Development
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov

Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community



City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

The Administrative Review Design Guidelines recommend the following:

- All exterior doors, especially entrance doors, are important elements contributing to the character of façades. Proportion, composition in elevation, detail and trim are all essential to the overall scheme.
- Where possible, original doors should be retained. This includes glass lights, original hardware, such as doorknobs, hinges and pulls. Do not widen doors and door openings or attempt to create new openings or install new doors on the exterior walls of the original structure.
- Do not plug, cover and/or widen window opening. It is the intent of these design guidelines that replacement windows match the appearance, materials, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities of the existing windows.
- Window styles range from the basic to the ornate. Frames, lintels, and sills were constructed of stone, concrete or wood. The finish must be in character with the overall appearance of the structure and adequately complement its style.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
- Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

Commissioner Helm asked Ms. Velázquez if there was a door where this smaller window is now inserted.

Ms. Velázquez responded yes, that is where the door was. In actuality, Ms. Velázquez believed the *door* was actually a *window* because the frame does not go all the way to the ground.

Commissioner Helm asked what the construction material was.

Ms. Velázquez responded adobe.

Commissioner Helm agreed with Ms. Velázquez' concerns because the detail, with the stucco surround, is not a historic detail. We see that a lot these days but it is not a carefully thought out detail.

Chairman Berchelmann explained there is some basic detail around the windows. On the original photo, is that wrought iron in front of the old windows?

Ms. Velázquez clarified, the iron gates, yes.



City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Chairman Berchelmann asked if Ms. Velázquez knew what kind of windows are behind the iron gates.

Ms. Velázquez thought they were wood, which is in keeping with the district. Looking around the neighborhood homes, some homes do have this sort of window surround but some do not. She could not say it was a typical feature, she would not say the majority of houses had that.

Chairman Berchelmann asked Ms. Velázquez what would be the best way to bring that into compliance.

Ms. Velázquez recommended:

- 1. The slider windows would have to go.
- 2. Replace with 1/1 sash or 1/1 sash with exterior applied 3-D muntins to simulate the windows that were there before.
- 3. The existing window surround, covered in mesh, will have stucco mounted on that, and can possibly be reduced so that it does not look so wide and to look like what was there originally.
- 4. Put back the original window type in this masonry opening.

She reminded commissioners that the work was done without permits. Code Enforcement ticketed this property and others in the neighborhood.

Mr. Ricardo Chavez, property owner, purchased this property, as a foreclosure, four or five months ago. The property was boarded up, all the windows were gone. He did not know what was on the property. He explained to Ms. Velázquez that he had wanted to repair the structure and use this as rental property; however, he decided this was more suitable for his father to have. The before photo was taken 14 year ago, when he bought it there were no windows, everything was broken, and the property was boarded up.

The first thing Mr. Chavez did was update the windows. He did not think it was in a historic district, he did not know. He bought the property as a foreclosure and everything was boarded up.

Chairman Berchelmann asked Mr. Chavez if he bought the property on the courthouse steps, at an auction, through an agent.

Mr. Chavez explained he had bought the property through a bank, through an agent.

Chairman Berchelmann asked Mr. Chavez if the agent told him it was historic, was the agent representing you or the bank.

Mr. Chavez replied no, he was representing me.



City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Chairman Berchelmann wondered if Mr. Chavez had seen photos of the property before he purchased it, did he see photos of the property's condition before he bought it.

Mr. Chavez stated he went to see the property when he purchased it, but everything was boarded up from the inside out because of vandalism. This is not a very good neighborhood. Other properties in the neighborhood have slider windows so Mr. Chavez did not understand why Ms. Velázquez would not let him put sliders on his property. Code Enforcement cited him and told him to stop all construction.

Chairman Berchelmann asked if Code Enforcement informed Mr. Chavez the property was in a historic district.

Ms. Velázquez explained that Mr. Chavez came to her office. As for the slider windows, if your neighbor has sliders there are several reasons:

- 1. The windows existed prior to the historic district designation;
- 2. The windows might be there illegally;
- 3. The windows might have been approved by the Historic Landmark Commission at one time. Ms. Velázquez would send Code Enforcement out to investigate. If the windows were installed illegally, those property owners will be cited.

Mr. Chavez had photos of the windows on his cellphone.

Vice-Chairman Lopez explained this was like a territorial style house with a lot of character. Vice-Chairman Lopez could see the window surround, if it could be removed, especially that top rail. Vice-Chairman Lopez suggested:

- 1. Install masonite because it looks like wood;
- 2. Replace the windows with divider lines to keep the same look and feel of the house.

This will give you more value than replacing with these suburbia type of surrounds used on the windows.

Commissioner Helm suggested Mr. Chavez research the James Hardie Company for construction materials. This company's most common construction materials are Hardie plank siding and Hardie board; additionally, they manufacture all sorts of trim out of the same materials, cement based product, with a wood grain effect. This will allow Mr. Chavez to replicate both in wood and the Hardie material, which will have a much longer life span and you won't have issues with maintenance. Additionally, this material can be painted. This will replicate the historic appearance of the property as it was 14 years ago.

Mr. Chavez explained the reason he replaced the window pop outs is because practically all the windows were out of square. The man who installed the windows suggested he reinforce the frame of the windows because it was really weak and the wall was cracked.



City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Commissioner Gomez asked Mr. Chavez why he installed that small window compared to the size that was there previously. Was that a restroom?

Mr. Chavez thought there was a door on the outside, but on the inside there was no door, no way to go out, and it had that small window already existing. I know it looked like a door but it was not an actual door to go in or out of the structure when he bought it, perhaps in the past.

Chairman Berchelmann asked Mr. Chavez if was willing to make some changes.

Mr. Chavez responded sure, as long as commissioners did not make him replace all the windows again. He could do modifications on the outside, perhaps on the pop outs.

Commissioner Gomez reiterated Mr. Chavez must replace those slider windows.

Mr. Chavez explained instead of replacing the windows he was going to install a plastic grid to simulate that it is individual glass in every square.

Vice-Chairman Lopez thought that would be okay but Mr. Chavez needed to show commissioners a mock-up of the plastic grid.

Mr. Chavez showed commissioners a picture of the window, with the mock-up of the plastic grid.

From the picture, Vice-Chairman Lopez asked Mr. Chavez if he had applied the plastic grid or if this was an existing product.

Mr. Chavez responded the plastic was applied, after the fact, to just one window so commissioners could see and perhaps approve it.

Chairman Berchelmann asked Mr. Chavez if there were other windows on the property where he had applied the grid.

Mr. Chavez added the plastic dividers to simulate like a Victorian style window. If commissioners approve, the plastic can be stained to simulate wood.

Per the photos of the window surrounds, Commissioner Moses asked if this was metal netting.

Chairman Berchelmann stated it was chicken wire. Commissioner Gomez noted and two by fours.

Mr. Chavez agreed it was chicken wire and two by fours because he was going to put stucco over that.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

Vice-Chairman Lopez interjected Mr. Chavez would be replacing that.

Mr. Chavez agreed if that is what the commissioners request.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked about the size of those windows and if Mr. Chavez would be leaving this one the way it is currently.

Mr. Chavez explained that was the initial space for that window.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked if Mr. Chavez would be replacing the window that is currently a slider with an originally sized window.

Mr. Chavez explained that is the original size, what was under looked like a door on the outside but on the inside there was no actual door to open.

Ms. Velázquez asked Mr. Chavez if was going to put a door there.

Mr. Chavez responded no, he was going to cover that up because it is facing toward the main street.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked to see photos of the space that looks like a door; he stated that Mr. Chavez had changed the look completely. Vice-Chairman Lopez explained that was a transom window above the door.

Mr. Chavez added so I simulate that same window on top that was just removed?

Vice-Chairman Lopez interjected you removed the door and you blocked the entrance.

Mr. Chavez stated no ... what had looked like a door, like I said there is no access inside the structure even though it looks like a door on the outside, on the inside there is no door.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked Mr. Chavez if he still had that door.

Mr. Chavez responded no.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked if Mr. Chavez could leave that door and cover it from inside, just to have the same look.

Mr. Chavez explained it was already covered from the inside and there is sheetrock on the inside.

Vice-Chairman Lopez replied I know but, like before, it was a door and it was blocked from inside right.

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez



Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Mr. Chavez replied I'm assuming.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked Mr. Chavez if you do not want to use the door you can block it from inside, but outside you must have the same look.

Mr. Chavez stated that could be done, something to simulate a door.

Vice-Chairman Lopez responded especially if Mr. Chavez could find an old door at McKinney Wrecking Company or one of those old door stores, to make it look like the original structure.

Mr. Juan Valles, General Superintendent, Vistacon, and Mr. Chavez's cousin, stated he was helping his cousin so that he will be in compliance. Mr. Valles recommended to Mr. Chavez patching to match the original surface with a control joint on each site to avoid any more broken panels or whatever is left. That way we can match the color and texture with the existing structure. As far as the header, I was thinking about doing like a viga type, we do work with EFIS and all that stuff, we can do the EFIS on top and make it look like a viga on top, make it look like it was originally. I do not think there will be many modifications. Per Vice-Chairman Lopez's suggestion about the door, we can find it over at McKinney or there is a place in Tornillo where they replace and make those old antique doors. All we are trying to do is comply with what the city is asking for.

Vice-Chairman Lopez responded the character must be brought back by replacing those window surrounds but why use stucco.

Mr. Valles explained the reason we did is because the structure does not have what we call a header, it had an old type of lintel which had a two by eight facing flat and the adobe on top. So what we did was tried to modify it just a little bit without changing the structure of it so we can reinforce the structure for the window as well as for the structure of the house. As far as those pop outs, we can remove them. The reason I put them there was to cover up the two cripples and one king stud that we were able to put in some of the areas.

Vice-Chairman Lopez understood; however, you can cover that with heavy planks or masonite or something but not with foam. With foam it would be too obvious that it was fake.

Mr. Valles agreed, we can use masonite or the Hardie board, as suggested. Mr. Valles had suggested to Mr. Chavez to just to make it flat and to look the same so that once we paint it it would look similar. Mr. Valles understood, as far as the historical look, to make it look as if there wasn't a patch. Yes, we can remove those pop outs from there.

Ms. Velázquez asked Mr. Valles if he worked with Vistacon and was Vistacon a contracting company.



City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Mr. Valles responded yes and explained Vistacon is a general contractor and he is one of their field superintendents.

Ms. Velázquez then asked Mr. Valles if he has done work for the city before and if he was aware that this type of work required a permit.

Mr. Valles responded yes and explained he does understand he and his cousin required a permit; however, he did not know that his cousin had bought the house until Code Enforcement issued the citation.

To clarify, Ms. Velázquez asked if Mr. Valles was assisting his cousin, Mr. Chavez, with the work, without a permit, knowing that he needed one or did Mr. Valles come in afterward.

Mr. Valles responded he came afterwards.

Chairman Berchelmann stated it looked like this request can be approved, with some modifications that will satisfy the guidelines, at least as closely as possible, and the concerns that were brought up today; additionally, this will allow Mr. Valles to move forward with this property. Chairman Berchelmann listed the following concerns:

- 1. Where the door was replacing it with something similar, same color (white or cream); Ms. Velázquez can work with the applicants on the color;
- 2. Changing the pull outs with masonite or Hardie board, flat, similar to what was there previously, per the photograph 14 years ago
- 3. Applying the exterior muntins to the existing windows.

Ms. Velázquez asked about those slider windows, what was decided.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked if those were bedrooms.

Mr. Valles replied the one with the door is like a kitchen.

Vice-Chairman Lopez clarified, where you placed the single-hung windows, are those bedrooms? Additionally, Vice-Chairman Lopez asked if Mr. Chavez would be installing bars on those windows.

Mr. Chavez replied yes, those are bedrooms. He was debating whether to put bars on those windows since this is an area of concern but he wasn't sure yet.

Mr. Valles asked commissioners for suggestions.



City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Vice-Chairman Lopez explained one thing about this house, the windows are always recessed, the walls are so wide and deep. Currently, the windows are on the face of the wall and that in itself creates a different look. Vice-Chairman Lopez suggested installing iron bars again, with a historic look, but they would have to be reparable since this is a leaking unit. There are ways to unlock it from the inside.

Vice-Chairman Lopez understood Mr. Chavez' concern for security/safety since the window faced the sidewalk, people walking by, etc. cause for concern.

Chairman Berchelmann clarified keeping the decorative wrought iron that will allow for ingress/egress on the property

Vice-Chairman Lopez added that will block some of the view of the sliders, the single hung, that we don't agree on. But since there has to be some access from the dormitories, you need to have that also.

Mr. Valles explained his uncle will be 70 years-old, there has to be some kind of accessibility in case of any emergency.

Commissioner Helm asked if Ms. Velázquez if she was considered about the single-hung vertically operable windows or horizontal sliders.

Ms. Velázquez replied horizontal sliders.

Commissioner Helm referred to the slider window that replaced the transom window. Ms. Velázquez explained, from here that transom looks like a tripartite transom.

Vice-Chairman Lopez replied it's hard to tell if it was a single divided light but it was probably a fixed transom.

Regarding changing the windows, Mr. Valles explained we have to have accessibility. When the wrought iron is covering the window and the windows being so low to the ground, person(s) must be able to exist safely in case of emergencies. My uncle needs enough room to escape through the window just in case of emergency. The sliders will be a smaller space, not enough space to allow a person to escape comfortably.

Commissioner Helm explained commissioners are not suggesting Mr. Chavez install sliders. Ms. Velázquez is concerned with the horizontal slider that was put in for the transom, on the top of the door.

Comparing photos of the structure 14 years ago to photos taken recently, Ms. Velázquez explained that windows are very prominent on the main façade. So, you have that slider and you have the transom. She asked commissioners if they wanted to retain those sliders. Vice-Chairman Lopez confirmed the sliders will have to be replaced.

Economic & International Development
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov
Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez Ms. Velázquez asked if they should replace the slider with the 1/1.

Commissioner Helm explained if the transom was operable at all, the transom was either awning or hung. So those should be a single hung, that window on the left, or double-hung.

Mr. Chavez clarified commissioners want us to replace those two sliders.

Commissioner Helm responded yes, and mock up the door underneath the transom.

Chairman Berchelmann included adding the wrought iron on the other windows.

Commissioner Helm yes, if they can do an egress wrought iron.

Ms. Velázquez asked if commissioners wanted exterior dimensional white muntins or just wrought iron in place of that.

Vice-Chairman Lopez responded no, exterior muntins, four dimensional, like the one Mr. Chavez showed pictures on his cell phone.

Ms. Velázquez clarified:

- 1. Mr. Chavez can keep the 1/1 windows he has now;
- 2. Mr. Chavez has to apply exterior applied 3-dimensional muntins to simulate the divided lines;
- 3. Mr. Chavez has to put on a historic iron railing on those windows;
- 4. Mr. Chavez has to replace the slider windows with the 1/1, except for the transom window. The transom window can be a fixed or awning window.
- 5. The mesh window surrounds must be replaced with Hardie board or masonite to simulate wood and can be painted, in a cream color or white.
- 6. Mr. Chavez must put the door back in place; the door must be made of wood, like before 14 years ago, very simple.

Chairman Berchelmann asked if Messrs. Chavez and Valles were agreeable to the modifications. They can move forward with the rehabilitating project; however, please consult with Ms. Velázquez prior to making any decisions on your own.



City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Helm, seconded by Commissioner Gomez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE WITH MODIFICATIONS AS FOLLOWS:

- 1. REPLACE HORIZONTAL SLIDERS WITH 1/1 OPERABLE, SINGLE-HUNG WINDOWS;
- 2. REPLACE TRANSOM OVER THE DOOR WITH EITHER FIXED OR AWNING WINDOW;
- 3. REPLACE THE DOOR IN ITS ORIGINAL LOCATION WITH A DOOR;
- 4. REPLACE THE WINDOW SURROUNDS WITH WOOD OR LIKE MATERIAL SUCH AS A HARDIE BOARD OR MASONITE TYPE MATERIAL THAT IS PAINTED WHITE OR CREAM;
- 5. REPLACE THE WROUGHT IRON OVER THE WINDOWS AS OF WHAT'S BEFORE PROVIDED THAT IT CAN BE EGRESS COMPLIANT;
- 6. APPLY EXTERIOR THREE-DIMENSIONAL WHITE MUNTINS OVER THE 1/1 WINDOWS TO SIMULATE THE ORIGINAL DIVIDED LIGHTS

After the vote, Mr. Valles asked if the wrought iron would be on the front, on this side of the house, or every single window.

Vice-Chairman Lopez explained the bars should be on the lower windows. There are historic looking wrought iron bars instead of the ones that are just square bars. Bars, with hinges on the side, like similar to the Mexican Haciendas.

Chairman Berchelmann added Ms. Velázquez would be available to assist Mr. Chavez and Mr. Valles with any questions or concerns you might have.

4. Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. October 20, 2014 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for November 10, 2014 meeting. November 10, 2014 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the November 24, 2014 meeting.

Ms. Velázquez provided the following update for Commissioner Gomez:

209 Lawton Dr., Sunset Heights Historic District
Ms. Velázquez drove by the property and yes, new windows were installed without
proper permits being issued. Ms. Velázquez sent an email to both Code Enforcement and
Building Inspectors. When Code Enforcement cannot address it, Building Inspectors can
now step in and issue violations. This will be taken care of and she will be hearing back
from Code Enforcement or Building Inspectors.



City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

2. 1106 Mundy Dr., Sunset Heights Historic District

Ms. Velázquez had some bad news. It was painted before and was approved to be painted again. She understood the colors were not aesthetically pleasing to everybody. Paint colors are a very sensitive subject for property owners.

Ms. Velázquez brought photos of the structure with the peeling paint showing. Ms. Velázquez believed there is a new property owner who is trying to fix up the property to rent it. The property has therefore been taken care of.

HLC Staff Report

5. Update on Administrative Review Cases since the last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A")

At this time, Commissioner Gomez asked to be excused from the meeting.

Chairman Berchelmann asked commissioners if they had any comments and/or questions for staff.

PHHR14-00126-2906 Silver Avenue ...

Chairman Berchelmann asked if *Jeld-Wen* was just the brand name.

Ms. Velázquez responded yes, it is the brand name for windows, like *Pella* or *Anderson*.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Moses, seconded by Commissioner Helm AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE HLC STAFF REPORT.

Other Business - Discussion and Action

6. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for October 6, 2014

There were no minutes available for commissioners to review.

Ms. Velázquez noted Commissioner Helm had celebrated Birthday yesterday, October 19th, Staff and commissioners wished Commissioner Helm a Happy Belated Birthday.



City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Commissioner Moses noticed an error in the September 22nd meeting minutes that should be corrected to state that Fort Worth has its own Appeals Board designed just to take appeals from all these many commissions. Whereas, the minutes previously stated that prior to adjourning, Commissioner Moses noted he had researched the City of Fort Worth, Historic Landmark Commission decisions/appeals process. He explained all Historic Landmark Commission decisions/appeals are brought before the Historic and Cultural Landmark Commission.

Chairman Berchelmann remembered Commissioner Moses did make those comments.

Ms. Hamilton explained staff will place an item on the next agenda correcting the September 22nd meeting minutes.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Berchelmann, seconded by Vice-Chairman Lopez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 5:20 P.M.